



Community Based Education Policy

Annex 1: CBE Costing Framework

November 2018

Contents

List of Acronyms	2
Introduction	1
CBE implementers’ position on CBE provision and costing	1
IP Costing Framework Development Process	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Standard CBE package minimum requirements	2
Minimum and maximum costing range per grade	3

List of Acronyms

CBE	Community-Based Education
CSE	Conflict Sensitive Education
DED	District Education Department
DP	Development Partners
EiE	Education in Emergencies
GIRoA	Government of the Islamic Republic of Afghanistan
INEE	The Inter-Agency Network for Education in Emergencies
INGO	International Non-Governmental Organization
INSET	In-service Teacher Training
IP	Implementing Partners
IRC	International Rescue Committee
MoE	Ministry of Education
NESP III	National Education Strategic Plan for Afghanistan III
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
PED	Provincial Education Department
SMS	School Management Shura
TED	Teacher Education Directorate
WG	Working Group

Introduction

A revised Community Based Education (CBE) policy and guidelines document was signed in January 2018. The new CBE Policy demands improved coordination of CBE service delivery as well as developing strategies to improve the sustainability, equity, cost-effectiveness, and scalability of CBE services (Revised CBE Policy, p. ii). The policy and guidelines document states that an associated costing framework must be developed to support quality implementation of the CBE policy.

This costing framework takes the CBE minimum standard package and calculates minimum and maximum costs for the delivery of that package, to guide donors, NGOs and the MoE with regards to appropriate costs for the delivery of the standards set out in the policy. This first standard CBE Minimum Standards Costing Framework will apply to all new MoUs three months after the standard costing framework has been approved by the MoE, and will be effective for two years thereafter, whereupon it will be reviewed and if necessary revised via the CBE Working Group. New projects may have costs which exceed the maximum if they also deliver value-added components. However, these value added inputs and their associated costs must be distinguished in project budgets and negotiated with the MoE for approval. This will ensure that when CBE classes transfer to MoE oversight (this being a requirement of the CBE Policy), they will be sustainable and affordable. Of total programme costs, at least 70% should be project costs, no more than 23% administrative costs, and no more than 7% overhead costs.

This narrative document is a reflection of the MoE CBE Minimum Standards Costing Framework¹. Through a consultative process with the Ministry of Education and members of the CBE Working Group (including the co-chair DFID, and other donors and development partners) the costing ranges have been compiled and reviewed by Aga Khan Foundation, International Rescue Committee, UNICEF, CARE, Save the Children, CRS, BRAC and Swedish Committee for Afghanistan, to reflect the actual costs of CBE service delivery based on the experience of implementers and the MoE. Following review by the Ministry of Education and the CBE Working Group and Steering Committee, this Costing Framework will be formally submitted for approval by the Ministry of Education.

CBE implementers' position on CBE provision and costing

Education in Afghanistan has made huge strides over the last 15 years, but the country lacks the infrastructure and resources to provide formal schooling to all of its school-age citizens. It is estimated that over 3.7 million girls and boys, aged 7 to 15 years, in Afghanistan remain out of school, representing almost 44% of the primary school aged population. Over 60% of these out of school children are girls, with this gender disparity reaching even higher rates in certain provinces; the gap is wider for girls in rural areas, where nearly 60% are out of school compared to 24% in urban areas.¹ Drop-out rates are high, and 22 percent of enrolled girls and boys are permanently absent in primary grades.² CBE is a vital mechanism to reaching children in rural communities who cannot easily access formal schools. The importance of CBE

¹ Hereafter, this is referred as Costing Framework.

² All statistics are extracted from the 2016 Education Management Information System (EMIS) of the NESP III and the UNICEF Education Fact Sheet 2017.

has been enshrined within the NESP III, which emphasizes the pillars of equitable access, quality and relevance and efficient and transparent management. CBE is crucial to all three pillars, providing direct access to quality education for children who do not have access to formal schools (particularly girls) due to distance, poverty and cultural barriers, training local teachers to provide inclusive, gender equitable tuition, and ensuring that CBE classes are effectively run, monitored and linked with the formal system. GOIRA lays out its plans to expand and institutionalize CBE to reach a targeted 3.7 million additional children in 2017-2021 in the NESP III.

When establishing a standard costing range for CBE, the emphasis must be retained on the pillars of access, quality and management. These areas must remain at the heart of discussions around cost effectiveness. It is not enough to talk about numbers of children attending CBE if quality learning is not occurring, and if the most marginalized children are not being reached or when an emergency or a conflict happens. At the same time, costs must be set responsibly to ensure that as many children can be reached and can achieve sound learning results through CBE funding as possible.

Sustainability must also remain at the center of the costing discussion. IPs recognize that the ultimate responsibility over CBE students lies with the Ministry of Education, and that the Ministry is accountable for taking on costs related to outreach schools once CBE project funding cycles end. As such, it is important to be realistic when setting a costing range.

Standard CBE package minimum requirements

The minimum package of costs related to provision of a quality CBE class includes the following (based on CBE quality minimum standards (CBEMS) in the CBE Policy):

Program Cost

- Teacher salary
- Teacher training
- Classroom kit
- Student kit
- Teacher kit
- Textbooks
- Heating system and supplies
- Community mobilization
- Shura training

The proportion of direct staff costs which are directly related to the delivery of the CBEMS may be categorised as programme costs, based on discussion with the MoE at MoU negotiation stage. In most cases this will only be a percentage of a staff member's salary.

Administrative Costs *(do not require takeover once classes transition to MoE and the max amount cannot exceed 23% of the total budget)*

Overhead Costs (do not require takeover once classes transition to MoE and the max amount cannot exceed 7% of the total budget)

It should be noted that administrative costs and overheads are the unique responsibility of the implementing organizations, and do not require any form of takeover from the Ministry of Education once the classes are handed over. All other costs are for minimum requirements for any CBE, so would have to be maintained once the class transitioned to MoE oversight.

The costing range is based on the assumption of a CBE running for 3 years, and having an average of 30 students for grade 1-6 and 20 students for grade 7-12.

Minimum and maximum costing range per grade

The CBE Working Group, led by the Ministry of Education, has come together to consolidate the costs and calculate a reasonable costing range for the CBE class standard package. It has been agreed that having a single unified cost is impossible, since the context of CBE classes differ widely. For example, costs related to running a CBE in provinces such as Parwan, Bamyan or Herat are lower than for provinces such as Badakhshan, for which field staff have to travel through Tajikistan to access the remote border communities. The assumptions behind the minimum and maximum points of each costing range are as follows:

Minimum: located closer to hub schools (3km) or close to one another (requiring lower transportation and administrative costs to reach for delivery of materials, training, monitoring); relatively stable security situation; warm climate

Maximum: very remote location (5km or more from hub school); poor and unstable security situation; very cold or very hot climate; low availability of qualified teachers, especially female ones; concentration of returnees and IDPs

The below costs represent the amount per student needed to establish the first year of a CBE class for a particular set of grades. In subsequent years the cost is likely to be less, due to one-time items being purchased in the first year. To note that unit costs increase at higher levels of education, primarily due to 1) the increased number of subjects and therefore textbooks required and 2) the higher costs of specialized teachers and the increased number of teachers required.

Table 1: CBE unit cost per student, per year (including administrative costs and overheads)

Grade level	Minimum cost (\$)	unit	Maximum cost (\$)	unit	Average cost (\$)	unit
CBE 1-3	99		162		131	
CBE 4-6	115		185		150	
CBE 7-9	130		208		169	
ALP 1-3	73		128		101	

ALP 4-6	83	142	112
ALP 7-9	92	156	124

Table 2: CBE unit cost per student, per year (not including administrative costs and overheads)

Grade level	Minimum cost (\$)	unit	Maximum cost (\$)	unit	Average cost (\$)	unit
CBE 1-3	69		101		85	
CBE 4-6	80		117		99	
CBE 7-9	91		133		112	
ALP 1-3	51		77		64	
ALP 4-6	55		87		72	
ALP 7-9	64		97		81	

Cost breakdown

1. Classroom Direct Cost (Program Cost)

1.1. Teacher salary

CBE teachers are paid according to the official government Pay and Grade salary scale for contract teachers, which is dependent on qualifications and experience. An average monthly teacher salary is approximately \$105. Since CBEs run for three years, CBE teachers will receive the salary for the whole year (12 months). The Teacher Salary Cost is calculated as min/max/average cost multiplied by the 12 months and divided by the number of students in an average CBE class (30).

For Grade 4-6, according to MoE policy two teachers are required per class, which according to MoE standards equates as 1.25 teacher salaries, since one teacher is not required to teach the full number of hours. For grade 7-9, three teachers are required equating to 1.5 teacher salaries.

Most CBE implementers pay one teacher one full salary, which equates to two teacher salaries for grade 4-6 and three teacher salaries for grade 7-9. This is due to the fact that CBEs are in remote areas, and it is not possible to hire a qualified teacher by paying them a partial salary. CBEs are located far from each other, and CBE teachers are not able to work in multiple classes to make up a full set of teaching hours, as is the practice in formal schools. Some CBE implementers run schools which are close to one another, in which case it is possible for teachers to split their time between several hours and the time can be allocated proportionately.

Table 3: Teacher Salaries, cost per child per year (12 months)

Grade level	Minimum cost (\$)	unit	Maximum cost (\$)	unit	Average cost (\$)	unit
CBE 1-3	36		48		42	
CBE 4-6	45		60		52.5	
CBE 7-9	54		72		63	
ALP 1-3	18		24		21	

ALP 4-6	22.5	30	26.3
ALP 7-9	27	36	31.5

1.2. Teacher Training

The majority of CBE teachers do not have the minimum qualifications required to be teachers, and do not have much experience teaching. It is common practice, enshrined by the CBE policy, to select the best available candidate within the local community, with a particular focus on selecting women to be CBE teachers. As such, CBE teachers often have not finished school themselves and may have as low as grade 5 or 6 education.

A differentiated package for teacher education should be developed according to the education level of the teachers. Each package must be linked with the MoE’s credentialing system so that teachers are able to gain formal certification as per the training received, and are able to be absorbed into the formal system. With quality education provision as the first priority, teachers should be trained for 60 days in the first year of the project, with 15 days of refresher/subject upgrading training each subsequent year. Teacher training costs include master trainers’ salaries, transportation, training materials and refreshments.

Table 4: Teacher training, cost per student per year

Grade level	Minimum cost (\$)	unit	Maximum cost (\$)	unit	Average cost (\$)	unit
CBE 1-3	10		12		11	
CBE 4-6	10		11.7		10.8	
CBE 7-9	10		11.7		10.8	
ALP 1-3	10		12		11	
ALP 4-6	10		11.7		10.8	
ALP 7-9	10		11.7		10.8	

1.3. Classroom Kits

As a minimum, classrooms should contain a floor covering, a blackboard and eraser, chalk, a water bucket for washing, a water dispenser and cups, a progress book, attendance book, a map, wall charts and trunk or storage kit. The blackboard, water bucket, water dispenser and trunk are one-time costs, purchased when a class is established. The rest are replaced yearly. Some IPs operating in areas with a high number of IDPs and returnees also include tents within the classroom kit package since classroom space is not available or not sufficient. The price for these materials (1.3., 1.4., and 1.5) may differ according to market availability.

A different kit is made available for Education in Emergencies (EiE) CBE programming, which include two tents, a school in a box kit with classroom, teacher and student materials, a floor mat and blackboard.

Table 5: Classroom Kits, cost per child per year

Grade level	Minimum cost (\$)	unit	Maximum cost (\$)	unit	Average cost (\$)	unit
CBE 1-3	2		3		2.5	
CBE 4-6	2		2.7		2.3	
CBE 7-9	2		2.7		2.3	
ALP 1-3	2		3		2.5	
ALP 4-6	2		2.7		2.3	
ALP 7-9	2		2.7		2.3	

1.4. Student Kits

Students should have pens, pencils, notebooks, paper, ruler, eraser, calligraphy pen or stick and ink, crayons, pencil sharpener, slate board and a bag. CBE students are from the poorest rural communities who do not have easy access to learning materials and cannot afford to pay for them, therefore student kits are an essential provision to ensure children attend class and learn. Student kits are replaced yearly. Kits for ALP students are replaced twice yearly or contain double the amount of materials.

Table 6: Student Kits, cost per child per year

Grade level	Minimum cost (\$)	unit	Maximum cost (\$)	unit	Average cost (\$)	unit
CBE 1-3	5		10		8	
CBE 4-6	6		12		9	
CBE 7-9	7		14		10.5	
ALP 1-3	5		10		8	
ALP 4-6	6		12		9	
ALP 7-9	7		14		10.5	

1.5. Teacher Kits

Teachers should have paper and card, pens, pencils, eraser, pencil sharpener, glue, tape, ring binder, whole punch, stapler, markers, calendar, a writing pad and briefcase or bag. Teacher kits are replaced yearly.

Table 7: Teacher Kits, cost per child per year

Grade level	Minimum cost (\$)	unit	Maximum cost (\$)	unit	Average cost (\$)	unit
CBE 1-3	1		2		1.5	
CBE 4-6	1.3		2		1.7	
CBE 7-9	1.3		2		1.7	
ALP 1-3	1		2		1.5	
ALP 4-6	1.3		2		1.7	
ALP 7-9	1.3		2		1.7	

1.6. Textbooks

Where possible, textbook procurement for CBE classes should be done by the MoE or in partnership with the MoE. This will reduce costs and improve CBE linkages with hub schools. However, where this is not possible, IPs will provide the textbooks.

A set of standard MoE textbooks is required per student for each grade. IPs procure textbooks in a manner which is as cost-effective as possible, but are not able to procure on a scale as large as the MoE, therefore the unit costs are higher than for the government. IPs select the textbook providers with the best available quality for the lowest price. There is some variation in unit cost due to different vendors having different costs (depending on quality and availability), delivery costs, and different scales of procurement (with larger scale bulk purchases being cheaper, but not always possible). ALP classes get two sets of textbooks in one year, since they study two grades per year.

Table 8: Textbooks, cost per child per year

Grade level	Minimum cost (\$)	unit	Maximum cost (\$)	unit	Average cost (\$)	unit
CBE 1-3	5		10		8	
CBE 4-6	6		12		9	
CBE 7-9	7		14		10.5	
ALP 1-3	5		10		8	
ALP 4-6	6		12		9	
ALP 7-9	7		14		10.5	

1.7. Direct Classroom Project Staff Salaries

The proportion of direct staff costs which are directly related to the delivery of the CBE Minimum Standard may be categorised as programme costs. In most cases this will only be a percentage of a staff member's salary. The roles whose salaries are eligible to be categorised under programme costs include project supervisor or master trainer roles, but may also include field monitors or other roles that involve the direct implementation of the CBE Minimum Standard package. The salary package for direct project staff will be for 12 months inclusive of the staff training, monthly salary, and transportation per 10 CBE classes. An indicative range is shown in Table 9. This salary package is based on the NTA salary scale for a Project Supervisor and Master Trainer on Grade E, normally steps 1 to 3 (NTA Policy, P. 11). CBE implementers are advised to hire one Community Mobilizer per 10 CBE classes within the minimum and maximum cost range.

Table 9: Direct Classroom Project Staff, cost per (10 class) per child per year

Grade level	Minimum cost (\$)	unit	Maximum cost (\$)	unit	Average cost (\$)	unit
-------------	-------------------	------	-------------------	------	-------------------	------

CBE 1-3	10	17	13.5
CBE 4-6	10	16.7	13.3
CBE 7-9	10	16.7	13.3
ALP 1-3	10	17	13.5
ALP 4-6	10	16.7	13.3
ALP 7-9	10	16.7	13.3

1.8. Heating/Cooling system

In cold areas, classrooms should contain a heating system (bukhari) and fuel. In hot climate areas, the bukhari should be substituted for a fan for cooling. The bukhari or fan are a one-time cost; fuel needs to be calculated yearly. In some areas with temperate climate, neither heating nor cooling is needed for CBE classes during the winter or summer break. In areas of extreme heat during the summer and cold during the winter, both heating and cooling may need to be provided during the year. Where costs for this exceed the maximum unit cost, IPs should present a justified case for increased expenditure on heating/cooling costs and the community should be mobilized to contribute to the cost if possible (fuel and maintenance).

Table 10: Classroom Heating/Cooling System, cost per child per year

Grade level	Minimum cost (\$)	unit	Maximum cost (\$)	unit	Average cost (\$)	unit
CBE 1-3	-		2.5		2.5	
CBE 4-6	-		2.5		2.5	
CBE 7-9	-		2.5		2.5	
ALP 1-3	-		2.5		2.5	
ALP 4-6	-		2.5		2.5	
ALP 7-9	-		2.5		2.5	

1.9. Shura/Community Mobilization Training

When a CBE is established, an IP needs to visit the community to build support for the class, including encouraging parents to register their children, establishing a shura and helping the community locate space to hold the class. This cost consists of transportation to the community and staff salaries. Effective community mobilization is particularly important when establishing girls' classes, as evidence from conservative areas shows communities are open to classes for boys but less open to classes for girls. Sometimes IPs are required to visit and sit with communities several times together with elders, PED/DED representatives and shuras in order to encourage parents to register girls in classes. Community mobilization costs are higher for areas where CBEs are more remote or far from each other, and where communities are more conservative and require more visits before a class can be established.

Where possible, IPs will engage with the Department of Social Mobilization and Shuras to channel mobilization through local SMSs in the interests of sustainability and cost effectiveness. This will be less possible and less impactful in areas where SMSs have not been established yet or have low capacity.

CBEs are overseen and monitored by a School Management Shura which is responsible for visiting the class and monitoring the classroom conditions and teacher attendance, following up on absenteeism and dropouts, advocating with local education authorities on behalf of the class, resolving local disputes and communicating issues on behalf of the community and the IP. As IPs move towards sustainability pathways offered through the Citizen Charter program, the role of education shuras is even more key in supporting ongoing management of the classes.

Table 11: Community Mobilization Training, cost per child per academic year

Grade level	Minimum cost (\$)	unit	Maximum cost (\$)	unit	Average cost (\$)	unit
CBE 1-3	-		10		10	
CBE 4-6	-		10		10	
CBE 7-9	-		10		10	
ALP 1-3	-		10		10	
ALP 4-6	-		10		10	
ALP 7-9	-		10		10	

As a minimum, Shura training should include the following:

- Gender and girls’ and women’s rights including hygiene
- Roles and responsibilities
- Conflict resolution
- Advocacy and ownership
- Community organization and mobilization
- Child rights and Child Protection and Safeguarding
- Positive parenting
- Monitoring and evaluation

2. Administrative Costs

Delivering CBE incurs a number of additional costs. This often includes salaries of Management/administrative staff, master trainers, monitoring and reporting staff. Role titles may differ across IPs. Administrative costs can also include items such as, but not limited to, transportation costs, vehicle rental and office costs, etc. Costs differ depending on the operating model of individual organizations, but shall not exceed more than 23% of the total CBE fund.

Table 12: Other Program and Administrative Costs, cost per child per year

Grade level	Minimum cost (\$)	unit	Maximum cost (\$)	unit	Average cost (\$)	unit
CBE 1-3	22.78		37.29		30.04	
CBE 4-6	26.40		42.55		34.47	
CBE 7-9	30.01		47.81		38.91	
ALP 1-3	16.87		29.41		23.14	
ALP 4-6	19.00		32.69		25.85	
ALP 7-9	21.14		35.98		28.56	

Overheads

A proportionate amount of overheads are charged to the CBE running costs which include associated HQ running costs. These are not necessary for local NGOs. Chargeable overheads and their percentages differ according to the policies of individual organizations and donors. This Costing Framework allows for a maximum of 7% of the total CBE project budget to be allocated to overhead costs.

Table 12: Overhead Cost, cost per child per year

Grade level	Minimum cost (\$)	unit	Maximum cost (\$)	unit	Average cost (\$)	unit
CBE 1-3	7.00		11.00		9.00	
CBE 4-6	8.00		13.00		10.50	
CBE 7-9	9.00		15.00		12.00	
ALP 1-3	5.00		9.00		7.00	
ALP 4-6	6.00		10.00		8.00	
ALP 7-9	6.00		11.00		8.50	

Value Added Costs

As per the NESP III and the CBE policy revision, value added costs (VAC) may be included in CBE provision with the agreement of the CBETU. These costs improve the quality of learning for CBE students and support equitable access for marginalized groups in particular such as adolescent girls and children with disabilities. VAC costs may include but are not limited to:

- Libraries and resource centers
- Supplementary teaching and learning materials (aside from standard textbooks)
- School or class construction
- Classroom improvement projects
- Health and hygiene kits for adolescent girls
- EdTech
- Mobility, hearing or visual aids
- Sports materials

- Playground materials
- PED/DED capacity development/system strengthening
- Science labs for LSCBE classes
- Additional teacher development support such as Teacher Learning Circles

VAC should be considered on a needs basis with strong justification for their inclusion. They should propose innovative or proven solutions for learning and equity challenges specific to the Afghan context, referencing existing literature or research on associated results if possible. Prioritization of individual components of VAC should depend of the context of the individual classroom and be carefully considered and justified.

As per the CBE policy, IP costs related to CBE teacher professionalization and accreditation will also be considered a value-add, outside of the standard CBE package. It is assumed that these costs will ultimately be routed through on-budget funding.

Costing Categorization

All NGOs are requested to follow these guidelines when developing their budget for the proposals. Generally, the total budget should be divided into three parts, 1- Programme cost/direct classroom cost (at least 70% of the total budget), 2- other Programme and Operation cost (max 23% of the total budget) and 3- Overhead cost (7% of the total budget). The categorization of different inputs is elaborated further below:

1. Programme cost at least (70%)
 - Teachers' salary
 - Teacher training costs
 - Rent of building (location of the courses)
 - Classroom kits (including carpets, blackboard, teaching aids for walls etc.)
 - Student kits (including a school bag/backpack, notebooks, pens and pencils etc.)
 - Teacher kits (including teacher manuals, teaching aid material, notebooks, pens, and pencils etc.)
 - Textbooks
 - Warming and cooling equipment
 - Repairs cost
 - Transport cost for (teachers and students)
 - Maintenance cost (classes)
 - Social mobilisation activities
 - Potable water, sanitation and hygiene facilities
2. Other Programme and Operation costs max (23%)
 - Project implementation staff (in full or proportion)
 - Project monitoring staffing and activities
 - Evaluation costs
 - Communication cost
 - Transportation cost
 - Regional office cost (electricity bill, water bill, stationery etc)

- Regional office rent
3. Overhead cost (7%)
- % costs of main office

If any NGOs do not fall within the above-mentioned maximums in their budget breakdown, they should provide clear justification for additional expenses. Their proposals will be reviewed by a technical committee in MoE and if approved, an MoU will be signed between the NGO and MoE prior to the start or implementation of the project.

Value Added Costs (VAC)

When presenting costs to the MoE, NGOs will distinguish between the costs of delivering the CBE minimum standard package and value-added costs. Total project costs may exceed the maximum unit cost per student when VAC are included, but those VAC must be separately presented in the CBE Costing Framework to the Ministry of Education. The total cost of delivering the CBE standard package defined in the 2018 CBE policy may only exceed the maximum unit cost per student at the MoE's discretion if the MoE agrees that NGOs have provided sufficient justification.

Proposals, budgets, and MoUs will differentiate between the costs associated with delivering the standard package and costs associated with delivering value added items, citing justifiable donor requirements and the logical link to the project. (E.g. a girls' employability required donor component will need separate staff and have separate budget). This will ensure NGOs deliver within budgets that are sustainable in the long term, while leaving room for innovation in the short term. Any budget that exceeds the minimum standards CBE Costing Framework will meet the MoE to discuss and agree on the budget before implementation commences.

¹ UNICEF OOSC Report, at 21.